

COMMONWEALTH OF VIRGINIA
BOARD OF EDUCATION
RICHMOND, VIRGINIA
February 1-2, 2023

The Board of Education (Board) convened its business meeting on February 2, 2023, in the Board Room, 22nd Floor, James Monroe Building, 101 North 14th Street, Richmond, VA 23219, with the following members present:

Mr. Dan Gecker, President
Ms. Grace Creasey
Ms. Suparna Dutta
Ms. Anne Holton
Mr. Andy Rotherham

Dr. Tammy Mann, Vice President
Dr. Pamela Davis-Vought
Dr. Alan Seibert
Dr. Bill Hansen
Ms. Jillian Balow,
Superintendent of Public Instruction

President Gecker called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m. and welcomed Board members, staff, and visitors to the meeting. President Gecker noted that he approved Dr. Davis-Vaught's participation from Bristol, Virginia, via electronic means due to medical reasons.

MOMENT OF SILENCE

President Gecker asked for a moment of silence.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

The recitation of the Pledge of Allegiance followed the moment of silence.

RECOGNITION OF THE 2023 VIRGINIA TEACHER OF THE YEAR AND 2023 REGIONAL TEACHERS OF THE YEAR

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Ms. Holton made a motion to adopt the November 17, 2022, meeting minutes as amended. The motion was seconded by Dr. Mann and carried unanimously. Copies of the minutes were distributed in advance of the meeting.

PUBLIC COMMENT

- Kandise Lucas expressed concerns regarding special education.
- Melissa Siddiqui expressed concerns regarding special education.

- Peter Wales spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Sarah Finley spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Holly Hazard spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Catharina Genove Spoke about licensing for Montessori teachers.
- Corey Marie Borgman Spoke about licensing for Montessori teachers.
- Jonathan Hui Spoke about licensing for Montessori teachers.
- Wendy Shenk-Evans Spoke about licensing for Montessori teachers.
- Monique O'Grady Spoke about licensing for Montessori teachers.
- Martin Brown spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Brendan Gillis spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Marianne Burke spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Dr. Linda Deans spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Pastor Michelle Thomas spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Makya Little spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Barbara Laws Supporting Arts in schools
- Chris Jones spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Dr. Taylor Snow spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Andrea Mendoza spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Terrell Fleming spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Chris Bunin spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Wesley Hedgepeth spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Cheryl Binkley advocated for teaching and learning.
- Vicki Hobson spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Anne Evans spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.

- Beau Dickenson spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Dr. Ma'asehyahu Isra-UI spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- John Hobson spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Scott Brabrand advocated for transparency to ensure adoption of standards that are clear to constituents and commented about the cost tool error
- Alicen Brown spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Dr. Johnny Finn spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Jeff Coupe spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Kristine Troch spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Dane Kennedy spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Alice Reilly spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Wes Kite spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Zowee Aquino spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Samantha Futrell spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Gabriel Reich spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Crystal Parker spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Hollins Mills spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Emma Thacker spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- James Fedderman spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Emily Mathon spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Aouicha Hilliard spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Mitch Chan spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.

- Milton Hathaway spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Ashley Elstad spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Reverend Rudolph V. Sykes spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Mary Nancy spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Sharon Fitz spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Amy Acors spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Monica Hutchinson spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Michael Stempel spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Thomas Hindley spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Dorothy Roney spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Skip Choate spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- AJ Miller spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Katy Schultz spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Tonia Bledsoe spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Truphelia Parker spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Robin Allman spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Elka Mednick spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Allen Goldman spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Bernadette Chimner expressed concerns regarding Spotsylvania School Board issues.
- Jeffrey Glazer expressed concerns regarding Spotsylvania School Board issues.
- Dr. Zoe Spencer spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.
- Lorraine Wright spoke about the proposed revisions to the History and Social Science Standards of Learning.

CONSENT AGENDA

A. Final Review to Certify a List of Qualified Persons for the Office of Division Superintendent of Schools

[Name, Title] submitted this item for consideration by the Board. The material for this item can be found on [the Board's page on the VDOE website](#).

Mr. Rotherham made a motion to approve the list of qualified persons for the Office of Division Superintendent of Schools. The motion was seconded by Mr. Hansen. This motion was carried unanimously.

B. Final Review of Financial Report on Literacy Fund and Updates to the First Priority Waiting List

[Name, Title] submitted this item for consideration by the Board. The material for this item can be found on [the Board's page on the VDOE website](#).

Mr. Rotherham made a motion to approve the Financial Report on Literacy Fund and Updates to the First Priority Waiting List. The motion was seconded by Mr. Hansen. This motion was carried unanimously.

ACTION/DISCUSSION ITEMS

C. First and Final Review of Updates to Lab School Application Process Document (Lab School Application Guidelines)

Elizabeth Schultz, Assistant State Superintendent, presented this item to the Board. The material for this item can be found on [the Board's page on the VDOE website](#).

The Lab School Application process document was developed in 2010 and originally adopted by the Board in 2011, and was amended in August 2022 to address some of the changes needed due to the General Assembly's appropriation of \$100,000,000 in [Item 137.C.44](#) of the 2022 Appropriation Act to the College Partnership Laboratory Schools Fund (Fund).

The process document needs further technical updates in language and timelines to meet the current needs of the Board and the Department for the review and approval of Lab School Applications and to:

- Eliminate or reduce artificial time barriers in the application process which impeded eligible entities as defined in § [23.1-628](#) from applying;

- Clarify the duties of the Board’s appointed Standing Committee in the review and recommendation of Lab School Applications;
- Improve clarity on the application process for eligible entities; and
- Adopt common vernacular and Board-branding with the Board-approved Planning Grant Guidelines and Start-up and Per-Pupil Operating Funding Grant Guidelines.

The Superintendent of Public Instruction recommended that the Board of Education waive First Review and approve, and delegate to the Department management of further technical edits in the process document, to be called Guidelines for the Approval of College Partnership Laboratory Schools) and associated Lab School Application.

Mr. Rotherham made a motion to waive First Review and approve, and delegate to the Department management of further technical edits in the process document, to be called Guidelines for the Approval of College Partnership Laboratory Schools) and associated Lab School Application. Mr. Hansen seconded the motion. This motion was carried unanimously.

D. First and Final Review of Proposed Amendments to the Procedure for Dismissals to Comport with Legislation from the 2020 General Assembly (Fast-Track)

Jim Chapman, Regulatory and Legal Coordinator, presented this item to the Board. The material for this item can be found on [the Board’s page on the VDOE website](#).

During the 2020 Session, the General Assembly passed legislation ([SB377](#)) requiring amendments to the Board of Education’s *Procedure for Adjusting Grievances (Procedure; 8VAC20-90)*, particularly the procedure for dismissals found in [8VAC20-90-70](#). All changes are designed to align the regulatory text with §§ [22.1-309](#) and [22.1-311](#) of the *Code of Virginia*. This agenda item also includes amendments to [8VAC20-90-10](#) in order to conform the definition of “grievance” and add a definition of “military status,” pursuant to legislation in [2020](#) and [2021](#), respectively. On January 9, 2023, ABTEL recommended that the Board amend the *Procedure* as recommended in this item.

The proposed amendments to the *Procedure* incorporate these legislative changes and will follow the fast-track rulemaking requirements of the Administrative Process Act (APA). Section [2.2-4012.1](#) of the *Code of Virginia* provides the fast-track rulemaking process for rules that are expected to be noncontroversial. In this case, VDOE staff expects the item to be noncontroversial because the regulatory action is to bring the Board’s regulations into alignment with the relevant sections of the *Code of Virginia*.

The Superintendent of Public Instruction recommended that the Board waive first review and approve this fast-track regulatory action.

Ms. Dutta made a motion to approve the Proposed Amendments to the Procedure for Dismissals to Comport with Legislation from the 2020 General Assembly. The motion was seconded by Ms. Holton. This motion was carried unanimously.

E. First Review of Arlington County Public Schools Alternate Route to Licensure for Certain Endorsements Pursuant to House Bill 2486 of the 2019 Virginia General Assembly

Dr. Joan B. Johnson, Assistant Superintendent of Teacher Education and Licensure, presented this item to the Board. The material for this item can be found on [the Board's page on the VDOE website](#).

On November 14, 2019, the Virginia Board of Education (Board) approved proposed [Guidelines for Alternate Routes to Licensure in Response to House Bill 2486 of the 2019 Virginia General Assembly \(Guidelines\)](#). [HB2486 \(2019\)](#) required, in part, the following:

The Board shall develop guidelines that establish a process to permit a school board or any organization sponsored by a school board to petition the Board for approval of an alternate route to licensure that may be used to meet the requirements for a provisional or renewable license or any endorsement. Any such alternate route may include alternatives to the regulatory requirements for teacher preparation, including alternative professional assessments and coursework. The petitioner may proffer or the Board may impose conditions in conjunction with the approval of such petition.

The *Guidelines* became effective on January 23, 2020, after the 30-day public comment period. Pursuant to the *Guidelines*, Arlington County Public Schools (ACPS) submitted an application for an alternate route to licensure for their division. ACPS has hosted a [public Montessori program](#) for 50 years. The program provides Montessori instruction for students from pre-K through eighth grade. In 2019, ACPS opened the first stand-alone public Montessori school in the Commonwealth, and it houses the county's Montessori elementary program.

Primary Montessori classes are held at seven ACPS elementary schools, and the middle school Montessori program is housed at Gunston Middle School. The Montessori program is one of the most popular instructional choices within ACPS and boasts a robust number of student applicants to the program each year. In hopes of better supporting the sustainability and expansion of this successful program—and in order to more responsibly steward the resources of the district, school, and teachers—ACPS is seeking an alternate route to Virginia professional educator licensure for Montessori licensed teachers in early/primary education, elementary education, and middle school education.

Per the *Guidelines*, the Virginia Department of Education formed a panel of educational leaders to review ACPS's application (Attachment A) to determine if all competencies of an educator preparation program were met. After careful review and thoughtful discussion, the panel requested additional information to support and strengthen the application (Attachment B).

This initiative supports the Board's Comprehensive Plan to advance policies that increase the number of candidates entering the teaching profession and encourage and support the recruitment, development, and retention of well prepared and skilled teachers.

The Superintendent of Public Instruction recommended that the Board of Education receive for first review the recommendation of the department's panel to approve Arlington County Public Schools Alternate Route to Licensure for Certain Endorsements Pursuant to House Bill 2486 as presented.

F. First Review of the Proposed Revised 2022 History and Social Science Standards of Learning

Christonya Brown, History Coordinator; Andrea Emerson, Secondary History Specialist; Brandi McCracken, Elementary History Specialist; and Dr. Christine Harris, Director, Office of Humanities, presented this item to the Board. The material for this item can be found on [the Board's page on the VDOE website](#).

The proposed, revised 2022 [History and Social Science Standards of Learning](#) describe the Commonwealth's broad goals for student learning and achievement in grades K-12 history, civics, geography, and economics. Section 22.1-253.13:1 of the Code of Virginia requires a review of each Standards of Learning subject area at least once every seven years. Pursuant to legislation from the 2000 Virginia General Assembly, the Board established a seven-year cycle for review of the Standards of Learning. Thus, the History and Social Science Standards of Learning originally adopted by the Board in 1995 were reviewed and revised in 2001, 2008, and 2015.

In [August 2022](#) the Board received a presentation from VDOE about the process used to review and revise the standards to date. In [November 2022](#), the Board received a follow up presentation from VDOE providing a revision to the standards to date. At the November Board of Education meeting, VDOE was directed to use the November draft as a baseline document and to correct omissions, errors, consider public and board member comments, and to incorporate elements from the August draft and 2015 Standards. From November to January, the VDOE revised the draft standards and fulfilled all directives of the Board. Conversations were held with various cultural groups to address concerns, corrections, and omissions. VDOE content staff provided instructional guidance to the document arbiters regarding historical accuracy, timelines, and content appropriateness. Using the November Standards document as the baseline for the revisions, changes were made to broaden and clarify the content in history, civics, economics, and geography. The draft incorporates content from earlier drafts and new content to tell a more complete story about how the past has shaped the Commonwealth, the nation, and the world.

The following timeline for further review and action was presented:

Feb 2: first review

March 13-21: public hearing period, also an email inbox will be established for comments

Month of March: review public comments

April 20: proposed final review and adoption by the Board.

The Superintendent of Public Instruction recommended that the Board of Education accept the draft of the 2022 History and Social Science Standards of Learning for First Review.

Ms. Holton made a motion to substitute the January draft with the collaborative proposed standards created by the VASCD and AHS for first review. The motion was seconded by Dr. Mann. The motion did not carry, with Mr. Rotherham, Ms. Dutta, Mr. Hansen, Ms. Creasey and Dr. Seibert voting against the motion.

Ms. Holton made a motion to accept the January 2023 draft, removing pages 7, 8 and first half of page 9, for first review. The motion was seconded by Dr. Mann. The motion did not carry, with Mr. Rotherham, Dr. Seibert, Ms. Dutta, Mr. Gecker, Mr. Hansen, and Ms. Creasey voting against the motion.

Mr. Rotherham made a motion to approve the January draft of the History and Social Science Standards, as presented, for first review. The motion was seconded by Ms. Creasey. The motion was carried by majority, with Ms. Holton, Mr. Gecker, and Dr. Mann voting against the motion.

Dr. Seibert requested that a Word version of January 2023 document be made available as well as a strike through version of the 2015 standards that also include the 2023 revisions.

Mr. Gecker left the meeting. Dr. Mann presided henceforth.

PRESENTATIONS AND WRITTEN REPORTS

G. Report on the Timeline for the Review of the English Standards of Learning

Jill Noguerras, English Coordinator; Colleen Cassada, Middle School English Specialist; Carmen Kurek, Elementary English & Reading Specialist; and Dr. Christine Harris, Director, Office of Humanities presented this item to the Board. The material for this item can be found on [the Board's page on the VDOE website](#).

The *English Standards of Learning* were adopted in 2017 and are scheduled for review in 2023-2024. The 2017 English Standards of Learning and may be viewed online.

Goal 2 of the Virginia Board of Education (Board) Comprehensive Plan: 2018-2023 calls for the development of rigorous standards to promote college and career readiness through a review of all of the Standards of Learning (SOL) on a regular basis.

Using an established review process and criteria, the Virginia Department of Education (VDOE) plans a review of the current *English Standards of Learning* according to the attached projected timelines (Attachment A – Projected Timeline for the Review and Revision of the *English Standards of Learning* Document). The VDOE will seek input from K-12 educators, faculty from institutions of higher education, the business community, professional education organizations, citizens, and parent groups, as delineated in the timeline.

The Superintendent of Public Instruction recommended that the Board of Education receive this report.

H. Report on the Timeline for the Development and Revisions to the Science Standards of Learning Annual Education Preparation Program Profiles – Demonstration on the New Data Sets

Dr. Brendon Albon and Dr. Anne Petersen presented this item to the Board. The material for this item can be found on [the Board's page on the VDOE website](#).

The *2018 Science Standards of Learning* were adopted in 2018 and are scheduled for review in 2025. These standards included content and practice expectations for 13 grades/courses to include grades K-6, Life Science, Physical Science, Biology, Chemistry, Earth Science and Physics.

The *2018 Science Standards of Learning* did not address standards or curriculum frameworks for Virginia Board of Education (Board) approved courses at the secondary level for level II courses and environmental science. These laboratory science courses are listed in the *Board of Education Approved Courses to Satisfy Graduation Requirements for the Standard, Advanced Studies, and Modified Standard Diplomas in Virginia Public Schools*.

The lack of standards or curriculum frameworks for these eleven courses have led to inconsistent content and student expectations in courses offered across the Commonwealth. In addition, teachers have not had support in these courses regarding (a) what is to be taught or (b) how it is to be taught. This has been a particular concern for new teachers.

Currently, the Virginia Department of Education (Department) has in place content guidelines for these courses as intermediate support for divisions. The goal is to transition these content guidelines into standards and provide divisions and teachers instructional support through the development of a curriculum framework.

The eleven courses are as follows:

- Biology II: Anatomy and Physiology
- Biology II: Ecology
- Biology II: Genetics

- Biology II: Advanced Survey of Biology Topics
- Chemistry II
- Physics II
- Earth Science II: Astronomy
- Earth Science II: Geology
- Earth Science II: Oceanography
- Earth Science II: Advanced Survey of Earth Science Topics
- Environmental Science

Although the typical timeline for stakeholders and educators to review and revise the standards is approximately one year, the proposed timeline includes an additional year to develop and review both the standards and curriculum framework for the eleven Board-approved courses for which standards are not currently in place (see Attachment A).

The development and revision of the Science Standards and Curriculum Framework meet Goal 2 of the Board’s Comprehensive Plan: 2018-2023, which calls for the development of rigorous standards to promote college and career readiness through a review of all the Standards of Learning (SOL) on a regular basis.

The Superintendent of Public Instruction recommended that the Board of Education receive this written report.

I. Update on College Partnership Laboratory Schools

Elizabeth Schultz, Assistant State Superintendent, presented this item to the Board. Ms. Schultz provided an oral report in conjunction with Item C of the agenda. The material for this item can be found on [the Board’s page on the VDOE website](#).

The Superintendent of Public Instruction recommended that the Board of Education receive the report.

DISCUSSION OF CURRENT ISSUES – by Board of Education Members and Superintendent of Public Instruction

In reference to the accountability and accreditation presentation given at the work session, Mr. Rotherham made a motion that the Board be given the full range of options regarding reforming accountability and accreditation and that the VDOE be directed to begin work on fleshing out what phase 1 and phase 2 of the bifurcated accreditation and accountability system would look like. The motion was seconded by Ms. Creasey. The motion passed unanimously.

Ms. Dutta requested that the Superintendent bring the Board a report as to what authorization the state and the Board have, as well as what regulations exist, for honors subject designation.

Superintendent Balow affirmed that she will get this information to the Board as part of the March meeting.

ADJOURNMENT OF THE BUSINESS SESSION

There being no further business of the Board, Dr. Mann adjourned the business meeting at 5:40 pm.

CLOSED SESSION

The Board convened on Wednesday, February 1, 2023, at 10:00 a.m. for the purpose of considering disciplinary cases related to teacher licensure. Dr. Mann made a motion to enter into a Closed Session in accordance with § 2.2-3711 and/or 2.2-3712 of the Code of Virginia, under the following enumerated subsection:

Subsection 40: Discussion or consideration by the Board of Education of information relating to the denial, suspension, or revocation of teacher licenses subject to the exclusion in subdivision 11 of § 2.2-3705.3.

And that Deb Love, legal counsel to the Virginia Board of Education, as well as staff members Superintendent Jillian Balow, and Tim Nuthall, and Kevin Foster, whose presence would aid in this matter, participate in the closed meeting. The motion was seconded by Mr. Hansen and carried unanimously. The Board went into closed session at 10:00 am. Dr. Mann made a motion that the Board reconvened in open session at 12:00 p.m.

President Gecker made a motion that the Board certify by roll-call vote that, to the best of each member's knowledge, (i) only public business matters lawfully exempt from open meeting requirements under Chapter 37 of Title 2.2 of the Code of Virginia and (ii) only such public business matters as were identified in the motion by which the closed meeting was convened were heard, discussed or considered.

Board roll call:

- **Mr. Gecker-aye**
- **Mr. Rotherham-aye**
- **Ms. Dutta-aye**
- **Mr. Hansen-aye**
- **Mr. Seibert-aye**
- **Mrs. Creasey-aye**
- **Ms. Holton-aye**
- **Dr. Mann-aye**

Ms. Creasey made a motion to issue a license to the individual in Case No. 01. The motion was seconded by Mr. Hansen and carried unanimously.

Mr. Hansen made a motion to deny a license to Daniel Alan Weiss. The motion was seconded by Ms. Holton and carried unanimously.

Dr. Seibert made a motion to revoke the license of Darren Lamar Thornton. The motion was seconded by Ms. Creasey and carried unanimously.

WORK SESSION

The Board convened in a work session on Wednesday, February 1, 2023, at 1:30 p.m. The agenda and meeting materials can be found on [the Board's page on the VDOE website](#). The topics discussed included an update on the Proposed Revised 2022 History and Social Science Standards of Learning, proposed accountability revisions, and an overview of alternate routes to licensure. No votes were taken.

DINNER MEETING

The Board met for a public dinner on Wednesday, February 1, 2023, 6:45 p.m., at the The Hard Shell restaurant with the following members present: Ms. Dutta, Ms. Creasey, Dr. Mann, Dr. Seibert, Ms. Holton, and Mr. Rotherham attended. The following department staff attended Mrs. Jillian Balow, Superintendent of Public Instruction, Melissa Velasquez, Assistant Superintendent of Policy and Communications, and Mr. Jim Chapman, Acting Director of Board Relations. No votes were taken. The dinner event ended at 8:30 p.m.



Mr. Dan Gecker, President